



NATIONAL MARITIME FOUNDATION
AND
RAND CORPORATION DIALOGUE (2nd EDITION)

**“ADVANCING INDIA-US MARITIME SECURITY COOPERATION IN
THE INDO-PACIFIC REGION”**

New Delhi
14 – 15 November 2017

Edited by Cdr Prakash Gopal

Key Points

- Despite divergent perspectives on some issues, both Indian and US strategic visions for the Indo-Pacific region, converge significantly, thereby creating grounds for increasing cooperation and collaboration in multiple domains.
- Quite apart from the growing military/naval confluence between India and the USA, there are a number of avenues outside of the military/naval domain that are very well suited for increased collaboration between the two countries, particularly with regard to the Indo-Pacific region.
- Institutionalised mechanisms such as the Defence Trade and Technology Initiative (DTTI) have an important role to play in furthering strategic ties, whilst yielding mutual material benefits.

Policy Recommendations

- Both India and the US need to prioritise a number of specifically identified avenues of cooperation, with the aim of furthering economic growth and ensuring a ‘rules-based’ order in the Indo-Pacific region.
- One key area of cooperation involves capacity-building and capability enhancement of regional countries, wherein India and US need to evolve a more coordinated and efficient approach, so as to derive maximum benefits with economy of effort.
- The National Maritime Foundation and RAND Corporation could undertake collaborative studies to examine such potential areas of cooperation, with the objective of providing concrete and actionable recommendations to respective Governments. Three areas that hold-out particular promise are: (a) China; (b) Energy and risk-mitigation options; and (c) Security impacts of Climate Change.

Members of Delegations

National Maritime Foundation		RAND Corporation	
1.	RAdm Dinesh K Tripathi	1.	Dr. Jack Riley
2.	RAdm K Raja Menon (Retd)	2.	RAdm Mike McMahon (Retd)
3.	VAdm Satish Soni (Retd)	3.	Mr. Richard Girven
4.	VAdm Pradeep Chauhan (Retd)	4.	Mr. James G. Kallimani
5.	Dr C Raja Mohan		
6.	Mr Dhruva Jaishankar		
7.	Capt (Dr) Gurpreet Khurana		
8.	Cdr Prakash Gopal		

Agenda

Day 1: Tuesday, 14th November 2017

0930-1000 - Introductory Session

- Welcome and Introductory remarks by the Director, NMF: VAdm Pradeep Chauhan
- Introductory remarks by Head of Delegation, RAND: Dr Jack Riley

1000 -1105 - Session 1: Geopolitical and Security Environment in the Indo-Pacific – Threats, Challenges and Opportunities

Chair: Dr C Raja Mohan
Speaker 1: RAND: Richard Girven
Speaker 2: NMF: Dhruva Jaishankar

1135-1210 - Session 2: RAND Study Report on “**The Millennial Generation, Implications for the Intelligence and Policy Communities**”

Speaker: Richard Girven

1210 – 1315 - Session 3: India-US Naval Cooperation in the **Indian Ocean Region** – Challenges and Opportunities

Chair: RAdm ME McMahon (Retd)
Speaker 1: NMF: Cdr Prakash Gopal
Speaker 2: RAND: RAdm ME McMahon (Retd) & James Kallimani

1430-1535 - Session 4: Potential Scenarios, Challenges and Opportunities for India-US Naval Cooperation in the **Western Pacific**

Chair: RAdm K Raja Menon (Retd)
Speaker 1: RAND: Richard Girven
Speaker 2: NMF: Capt (Dr) Gurpreet Khurana

1535-1610 – **Session 5:** RAND Study Report “**Future Aircraft Carriers**”

Speaker: RAdm ME McMahon (Retd)
Audience Interaction and Discussions

Day 2: Wednesday, 15th November 2017

0930 – 1035 – Session 6: Potential Avenues for India-US Maritime (**non-Naval**) Cooperation

Chair: Dr Jack Riley
Speaker 1: NMF: VAdm Pradeep Chauhan (Retd)
Speaker 2: RAND: RAdm ME McMahon (Retd) & James Kallimani

1105 – 1210 – Session 7: Five Years of the Defense Trade and Technology Initiative (DTTI) – Evaluating Successes, Setbacks and Challenges

Chair: VAdm Satish Soni (Retd)
Speaker 1: RAND: RAdm ME McMahon (Retd)
Speaker 2: NMF: RAdm DK Tripathi, ACNS (P&P)

1210-1300 –Valedictory Session

Closing remarks by VAdm Pradeep Chauhan (Retd), Director, NMF
Closing remarks by Mr Jack Riley, RAND



Introduction

The second edition of the annual dialogue between the National Maritime Foundation (NMF), Delhi, and the RAND Corporation, Washington D.C., USA, was held at the Manekshaw Center, New Delhi on 14-15 November 2017. The theme of this dialogue was “**Advancing India-US Maritime Security cooperation in the Indo-Pacific Region**”.

Spread over a day and a half, the dialogue consisted of seven working sessions, dealing with geopolitics, defence technology, security cooperation and other crucial points of engagement between India and the US, especially in the naval and maritime domains. The RAND delegation presented two study reports, one on “**Millennials in the Workforce**” and the other on “**Future Aircraft Carriers**”.

The dialogue witnessed active participation from a diverse group consisting of academics, policy makers, security practitioners, think-tanks as well as the industry.

Key takeaways from each of the sessions are highlighted in succeeding paragraphs.



Session 1 – Geopolitical and Security Environment in the Indo-Pacific – Threats, Challenges and Opportunities

- The primary aim of major maritime powers in the Indo-Pacific region should be to evolve a framework for enhanced preparedness, capacity building and cooperation, thereby enabling the mounting of a coordinated, collective response to developing situations.
- While India has long realised the importance of viewing the Indian and Pacific Oceans as a contiguous maritime space, the time is now ripe for it to play an active and constructive role in this domain.

- While India and the US may have divergent approaches to the many challenges in the region, it is vital to identify and move ahead on common issues, setting and achieving modest goals to begin with.

Session 2 – RAND Study Report on “Millennials in the Workforce”

- Millennials – defined for the purpose of this report as those born between 1980 and 2004 – are already present in the workforce, with significant numbers having risen to the policy-making and decision-making roles.
- As a generation that has ready access to information of any kind, millennials generally tend to be skeptical of institutional structures and tend to challenge the *status quo* in government workplaces.
- With surveys indicating that millennials do not approve of governmental structures and often find themselves at odds with the environment therein, efforts must be made to understand the reasons why some of them still choose to join such workplaces, because this is critical to determining the most effective motivational options, as also in deriving maximum benefits from their capabilities.
- While this study report was focussed on millennials in the USA, India – with an estimated millennial population of over 300 million people – would need to understand the altered dynamics of this workforce that is largely youthful. This will enable optimal utilisation of their skills which, in turn, would be critical to India’s future socio-economic development.



Session 3 – India-US Naval Cooperation in the Indian Ocean Region – Challenges and Opportunities

- The MALABAR series of exercises has been a success story in as far as the naval engagement between India and the US is concerned. There is, however, a need to move beyond the visual and media-attractiveness of this annual event, even while enhancing its complexity. It is important that the scope for engagement be broadened in less visible but no less important areas.

- Although a change of Command at PACOM is scheduled on 15^h April, 2017, there is little doubt that Admiral Harris' successor will continue on the path of enhanced engagement between the two navies.
- The US and India may have to evolve means by which CENTCOM and AFRICOM can routinely but meaningfully engage with the Indian Navy, considering that their Areas of Responsibility (AOR) straddle India's primary area of interest.
- Although the bilateral defence/security relationship has largely been symbolised by increasing interactions between the two navies, India and the USA need to continually seek to expand the canvas of maritime, especially 'naval', cooperation in the Indo-Pacific region.

Session 4 – Potential Scenarios, Challenges and Opportunities for India-US Naval Cooperation in the Western Pacific

- India and the USA are poised to strengthen their bilateral strategic convergences, not only in the Indian Ocean but also in the maritime area eastward of the Malacca Strait, wherein India's geo-strategic stakes, as well as its military-strategic footprint, are likely to increase in the coming years, enabling substantive naval cooperation towards ensuring security and stability in the broader Indo-Pacific region.
- Indicative scenarios for such cooperation into the future may be driven by two possibilities. One scenario could be China ramping up its military assertiveness against India across the land borders, possibly in the medium-term time-frame, much before India has developed a credible strategic deterrence, or the requisite capability to influence events in the western Pacific. This could compel India to seek US military support to adopt an offensive posture in Pacific-Asia, and thus do America's bidding, albeit reluctantly. This could be very detrimental to all stakeholders, including India and the Pacific rim countries. This scenario would be less desirable even for the US as India would then become more of a liability than a support.
- An alternative future scenario would be for the long-term (*circa* 2030), when India has been able to largely achieve its national developmental objectives through diversified global balancing of its economic and security engagements. This would see India having enhanced not only its comprehensive power but also its stakes in Pacific-Asia in a manner that would expand its primary area of maritime interest to the western Pacific, coinciding with its expanded strategic frontiers. This would provide it the ability to moderate the assertiveness of China or any other destabilising factor (such as North Korea) in concert with the USA.

Session 5 – RAND Study Report “Future Aircraft Carriers”

- The *Ford* class of aircraft carriers are replacements for the *Enterprise* and *Nimitz* Classes, but are notably different in their design and operational philosophies.
- Due, however, to its high costs of construction, maintenance and manning, these Classes of ships may not serve as optimal templates for future aircraft carriers that could be part of the US Navy until the end of this century.
- For India, as it looks at various options for IAC 2 and subsequent aircraft carriers, the most important lesson that policy makers need to take away is that it may be prudent to

expend more resources at the design stage, and to lock-in the design until production, as even a small change of equipment can lead to large-scale changes on the vessel design and/or its performance through the life cycle.

Session 6 – Potential Avenues for India-US Maritime (*non-Naval*) Cooperation

- There are a number of areas outside of the naval ambit, that have potential of collaboration between US and India, including but not limited to the following:-
 - o Risk assessment relevant to China
 - o Regional Maritime Stability
 - o The importance of Indonesia to the Indo-Pacific region
 - o Energy risk mitigation
 - o India's ability to be a net security provider
 - o Geopolitical stability of the Persian Gulf region
 - o Humanitarian Assistance and Disaster Relief
 - o Mitigating effects of Climate Change in the maritime domain
 - o Maritime Law Enforcement
- NMF and RAND could examine some of these issues for future collaborative studies. The RAND Corporation has evinced immediate interest in, (a) Risk assessment relevant to China; (b) Energy risk mitigation; and (c) Mitigating effects of Climate Change in the maritime domain.



Session 7 – Five Years of the Defense Trade and Technology Initiative (DTTI) – Evaluating Successes, Setbacks and Challenges

- Despite being five years old, the DTTI actually took off only in 2015.
- The important thing about DTTI is that an adequate number of important people, both in India and the USA are convinced that this can be a means to transform the nature of the defence relationship between the two countries.
- India could examine the possibility of creating a structure, similar to the ‘India Rapid Reaction Cell’ at the Pentagon, which is able to take decisions on multiple aspects of this initiative.
- Some of the challenges that the DTTI faces pertain to the transfer of technology, the impact of the USA’s third offset policy, organisational structural challenges, and the tensions between the need to advance bilateral partnership versus the requirement of advancing defence trade.
- There is a need to establish timelines for individual projects and more importantly, for some big ticket items to actually fructify, so as to validate the usefulness of this initiative in both countries.



Way Ahead

The NMF and RAND need to undertake collaborative studies, beginning with the following topics, the outcomes of which could be deliberated at the next edition of the dialogue to be held in 2018:-

- Managing China and her assertiveness in the Indo-Pacific.
- The impact of Climate Change upon maritime security in the Indo-Pacific.
- 'Energy security' and the 'Security-of-Energy' in the Indo-Pacific.

Before a collaborative study is undertaken, however, there is a need to iron out a number of organisational and administrative issues, such as funding modalities, etc. Such an approach would yield maximum value to the engagement between the two organisations, and would have a positive impact on the trajectory of bilateral relations between India and the USA.

About the Contributors

This report was compiled from the record of discussions submitted by the dialogue rapporteurs Jyotishman Bhagwati, Vasudha Chawla, Surbhi Moudgil, Anjelina Patrick and Shahana Thankachan.